

SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS:
KILWA KISIWANI WORLD HERITAGE SITE

Development Bank of Southern Africa and
African World Heritage Fund

February 2009



Source: Author's photograph, January 2009

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Kilwa Kisiwani is a remarkable cultural World Heritage Site (WHS) off the South-East coast of Tanzania. The development of the site has been supported in recent years by the upgrading of transport infrastructure to the district of Kilwa, and rehabilitation and interpretation work at the sites of Kilwa Kisiwani and Songa Mnara. Commitment to development from both government and donors now places Kilwa Kisiwani and the Kilwa District in a favourable position to benefit from tourism. With the completion of the tarred road connecting Kilwa to Dar es Salaam likely in the short-term, tourism to the area will undoubtedly grow. Although the increases in tourism are not going to be immediately dramatic, the medium term could see Kilwa included in a growing 'Southern Circuit' of tourism destinations in Tanzania.

In order to ensure that the tourism development of the World Heritage Site and the district occurs in a manner that creates an excellent visitor experience, while benefitting local communities, both on the island and mainland, a deliberate design and structuring of the tourism experience is necessary. This will lead to the economic value of the sites becoming evident and will instill a vested interest in protection of the sites amongst beneficiaries. It will also help establish Kilwa as a must-see destination.

First and foremost, appropriate development of the site and the broader area requires coordination and organisation of the many stakeholders who already have been, and wish to be, part of the development effort in the area. Bringing a level of coordination to the existing efforts will immediately unlock benefits. In the context of this coordination, a clear overarching plan is needed. This plan should identify the roles for the various stakeholders including the national and district government, community groups both on Kilwa Kisiwani and the mainland, the tourism industry, ngos, and donor organisations. Many plans have been developed for Kilwa in the past, but few have been extensively implemented. An overall coordinating and organizing structure can assist with this much-needed implementation.

Kilwa is in a fortunate situation. The destination and its stakeholders have the benefit of being able to plan for future tourism development to ensure that it occurs in a way that maintains the sense of place (including the cultural and environmental integrity of the sites and area), provides an excellent visitor experience, and benefits host populations.

All stakeholders have a role to play in shaping the destination's development. With coordination, commitment and a clear strategy translating into implementation,

Kilwa could become a good example to other World Heritage Sites and emerging tourism destinations of how to plan and develop responsible tourism.

CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS	5
1.1 Research Methodology.....	6
2. SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS.....	7
2.1 Site Description and Context	7
2.2 Visiting the Island.....	10
2.3 Institutional Arrangements and planning.....	11
2.4 The financing models and revenue streams	19
2.5 The existing and potential visitor markets.....	20
2.6 Socio-economic and community impacts.....	21
2.7 Capacity constraints.....	22
2.8 The natural environment, and management thereof.....	22
2.9 The linkage between the cultural tourism attractions and broader destination development.....	22
3. RECOMMENDATIONS	24
3.1 Coordination and communication.....	24
3.2 Planning, information management, monitoring and evaluation	26
3.3 Developing A Visitor-centric approach	27
3.4 Creating Local Benefits	29
3.5 Tourism Capacity Constraints.....	31
3.6 Destination Effect.....	32
4. CONCLUSION	33
5. REFERENCES	35

1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS

There are currently 114 sites in Africa inscribed on the UNESCO World Heritage List: 38 in North Africa and 76 in the Sub-Saharan region. These sites have been proclaimed 'World Heritage' because of their Outstanding Universal Value. But compared to other continents, Africa is still left behind regarding the number of its World Heritage sites (114 out of 878). Moreover, most of the sites inscribed in the Danger List because of their deteriorating conditions, are located in Africa.

Therefore, in 2006, the African World Heritage Fund (AWHF) was established to assist African countries to increase the number of African sites inscribed on the World Heritage List, and to improve the management and conservation of African World Heritage sites especially those that have been put in the Danger List. Kilwa Kisiwani was identified as a possible pilot site in this regard.

Located in South Eastern Tanzania, Kilwa Kisiwani is a cultural site that contains the ruins of an Arab sea trading port. Broad aims for AWHF involvement at Kilwa are:

- to identify mechanisms to address the site damage and deterioration
- to recommend the development of appropriate infrastructure at the site, and
- to investigate opportunities for local communities to benefit from the development of the area.

The AWHF has partnered the Development Bank of Southern Africa (DBSA) in undertaking the situational analysis of Kilwa Kisiwani. DBSA is a development finance institution (DFI) that provides financial and non-financial support to projects in the Southern African Development Community (SADC) region.

As a DFI, the DBSA is keen to ensure that its work creates social and economic infrastructure and addresses market and institutional failures. One of the components of the DBSA's newly approved tourism investment strategy relates to the development of new destinations in SADC. These are to be developed around anchor projects and WHS's are identified as potential anchor projects in this regard.

In particular, DBSA wishes to understand how best to develop African WHS's as tourism destinations in order to unlock the economic opportunities and benefits that tourism can bring to often (rural) areas. In this regard, the DBSA is concentrating in its first phase on cultural tourism sites.

1.1 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The situational analysis of Kilwa Kisiwani prioritised primary research through informal discussions with stakeholders. In addition, certain documents¹ where available, were consulted to verify/ augment findings from discussions.

An initial introductory meeting was held with the Acting Director of Antiquities and a tourism official from the Department. Thereafter a site visit was conducted over three days. It included:

- A visit to District Council and meeting with its officials;
- Meetings with World Wildlife Fund and Mpingo Conservation project;
- A visit to the Kilwa Kisiwani site, including a limited tour of the ruins, and a meeting with representatives of the local Ruins Committee;
- Meetings with local community groups, namely: Kilwa Cultural Center, Changamoto, Upendo, Mkuje, and the local training college, Folklore;
- A visit to one of the groups to see their batik products;
- Discussions with one lodge manager, and a brief inspection of two other lodges.

Upon returning to Dar es Salaam, a broad stakeholder meeting was attended by representatives of the Ministry of Antiquities and of the Ministry of Tourism, UNESCO, the planning and policy unit of the Ministry of Antiquities, as well as Dr. Mesaki, an academic and researcher with insight and experience of the area. On the final day a meeting was held with the Acting Permanent Secretary of the Ministry, Mr. Kamamba.

Mr. John Kimaro of the Ministry of Antiquities was the official who facilitated the mission and coordinated the logistics. He also attended most of the meetings with stakeholders and assisted with translations, where necessary.

¹ The Ministry of Antiquities was having trouble with its email and internet services at the time of the visit. Few of the formal documents such as the Management Plan, visitor data, relating to Kilwa Kisiwani were provided.

2. SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS

2.1 SITE DESCRIPTION AND CONTEXT

Kilwa Kisiwani is an island that, together with the island of Songo Mnara, was inscribed as a cultural World Heritage Site (WHS) in 1981. Located on the Southern coast of Tanzania, some 333 kilometres south of Dar es Salaam, Kilwa Kisiwani is found offshore from Kilwa Masoko. Kilwa Masoko is a town that was established in the early 1950s and now serves as the administrative capital of the Kilwa district².

According to Moon (2005), the island of Kilwa Kisiwani “has been inhabited since at least the ninth century A.D”. She points out that it was at one point ruled by an independent African Sultanate and was at its most prosperous during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. The ruins that exist on the island today – a great number of structures - are the remains of what was once a great Swahili city-state.

Kilwa was situated on a major trading route linked to Persia and Southern Arabia in the North, as well as Mozambique in the South, and the interior. Gold, ivory, rhino horn were amongst the products traded. It was also active in the slave trade (although this came later, towards the eighteenth century). But Kilwa Kisiwani’s history dates back to before the days of active trading: late Stone Age and Iron Age artefacts have been found. These suggest that a community lived in the area as early as the fourth century. A wattle and daub style settlement has been dated to the beginning of the ninth century (Moon, 2005).

The first sultanate was founded around 1050 by a group of Islamic political refugees from Shiraz in Persia. The Great Mosque – one of the first structures – dates back to this period, although the remains today include the domed extension built later, during the 14th century.

² A Portrait of Kilwa by Dr. Mesaki provides a detailed overview of the origins and development of the three Kilwa’s – Kilwa Kisiwani, Kilwa Masoko and Kilwa Kivinge. It also provides a background on population dynamics, economic activities and so on in the area.

Figure 1: Ruins of the Great Mosque, Kilwa Kisiwani



Source: Author's own picture, January 2009.

The Portuguese arrived in the late 15th century and took control of the island. A fort was later built, and the existing trade routes - up and down the East Coast of Africa - were disrupted.

In the late 17th century Omani's took control and the commercial recovery of the island came about in the late eighteenth century. This recovery can be largely linked to the trade in slaves by both Omani and French traders (Moon, 2005). By 1811, however, Kilwa's fortunes had collapsed once again. Later, Kilwa Kisiwani came under the control of the Germans, who were consolidating their presence in East Africa.

The ruins on the island - of mosques, palaces and residences - depict the rise and fall of Kilwa Kisiwani under various colonial authorities' influences. Best known ruins' sites include the Malindi mosque and cemetery, the Gereza, Makutani, and tombs of the Sultans.

Kilwa Kisiwani, together with the related site of Songo Mnara nearby, was inscribed on the UNESCO WHS list in 1981, then more recently added to the WHS 'in danger' list. This was a deliberate move by the Ministry of Antiquities to acknowledge the risks facing the site, and the various areas that needed improvement. This decision to include the site on the 'danger' list was in order to be able to solicit support from partners who could bring technical skills as well as financial support to benefit the site.

Figure 2: Damage from the Seawave action



Source: Author's picture, January 2009.

Today about one thousand people live on the island, half of whom are under the age of thirty-five. The community of Kilwa Kisiwani lives in and amongst the ruins, creating some challenges from a site management perspective: there have been instances of vandalism, goats wander amongst the ruins, etc.

Prior to 2002/ 2003 which saw the construction of a bridge to link Dar es Salaam to the Kilwa District, and the rehabilitation of ruins on the island, visitor numbers at the site were negligible. Improved access, interest from various EU Embassies and others, as well as the development of a number of private sector lodges in the past few years, have resulted in slight increases in visitor numbers (estimated at about one thousand visitors in 2007, although opinions differ).

The broader district of Kilwa, comprising some 171 058 inhabitants (per the 2002 census), has six divisions or wards and is some 13958 square metres in size. Agriculture is the main industry, although it is largely made up of small scale farmers and fishers. Timber is also an industry in the area, and bee-keeping is practiced.

A land use plan is not yet in final form for all the wards. It is currently being developed for Kilwa Masoko town (the mainland town opposite the island of Kilwa Kisiwani) and will guide the spatial determination of economic activities in the town.

A number of possible tourism sites and activities exist at the broader district level. These include the Hippo pools, a Dinosaur site, and other cultural sites (including Kilwa Kivenge).

Although basic services are in place in Kilwa Masoko, these are erratic. During our visit there were a number of power outages. This also has an impact on water, as this is often pumped.

2.2 VISITING THE ISLAND

There exists no formal visitor centre on the island, or visitor embarkation point to the island. Current practice sees all visitors registering at the Ministry of Antiquities office within the District Council compound in Kilwa Masoko. Boat transportation to the island is then facilitated by the lodges (if they have sold a package to tourists including transportation to the site) or local dhows. In the case of official visitors, the Ministry's boat is utilised.

On the island, UNESCO and the Ministry's work on interpretation has seen information boards developed at the main ruin sites, and an official brochure/ map.

Figure 3: Interpretative Board for the Small Domed Mosque, Kilwa Kisiwani



Source: Author's picture, January 2009.

Paths and signposting around the island are, however, not yet formally in place. The ruins themselves are extensive (and further ruins are still to be uncovered and rehabilitated): the official brochure indicates that a short tour of the island's ruins takes around two hours. A longer tour can take up to one day.

As there is no power source on the island (solar panels were recently stolen), only warm refreshments are available from a few local shops. No food is available for purchase on the island. There are not as yet transportation services on and around the island, nor handicrafts/ curios/ merchandising for sale.

Although the latest visitor data has not been formally provided, indications of visitor numbers vary from 600 to 1500 per annum. Irrespective of the actual numbers, this range indicates that the site attracts relatively few visitors. Stakeholders indicated that visitor numbers have increased, but remain seasonal (the road from Dar to Kilwa which is difficult to navigate in good weather, is not navigable in the rainy season between the months of March and May), and are comprised of both leisure groups and specialists (including researchers, ambassadors, other delegations/missions).

2.3 INSTITUTIONAL ARRANGEMENTS AND PLANNING

2.3.1 Stakeholders and partners in the project

UNESCO

UNESCO has been active at Kilwa Kisiwani and Songa Mnara for many years: they have co-financed and assisted in rehabilitation of the ruins and interpretative materials.

Department of Natural Resources and Tourism

The Ministry of Antiquities within the Department is the official custodian of the site. They have five staff in Kilwa –although the staff are currently residing in the District Council's office and not on site as there is no power on the island. Work has been undertaken by the Ministry in conjunction with partners to rehabilitate, map and develop the site.

The Ministry of Tourism also falls within the Department of Natural Resources and Tourism. The Ministry has recently appointed an eco-tourism specialist who has taken an interest in coordinating work around Kilwa's development, and improving communication and alignment between the various stakeholder groups. The Ministry of Tourism currently has branch offices in Arusha and Dar es Salaam only.

District Commission

The District Commission provides local government functions in the area. Tourism is not a key activity, but incorporated into the Natural Resources portfolio within the District's offices. It has overlaps with other portfolios at the District level too, such as Development, Culture and Youth and Education.

French Government and EU Embassies

The French government is an important partner in rehabilitating the site and has been involved at Kilwa Kisiwani for some years. Together with the International Labour Organisation, they have recently shown an interest in local community development.

Further, a group of six EU Ambassadors visited Kilwa Kisiwani in December 2008, with an interest in understanding how to help contribute towards the development of the site.

SNV

An international NGO, SNV has been active in supporting pro-poor tourism development in Tanzania for some years. They are involved in cultural tourism development, particularly in Northern Tanzania. A report has been developed by SNV on Kilwa Kisiwani, according to one source. This was not available during the field visit.

Local residents

The Kilwa Kisiwani community is represented by the Ruins Committee – a committee of some twenty people which was established in 2002 to create a forum for the local community to express concerns/ desires around conservation and development of the island.

Those members of the Ruins committee who attended the meeting (about 8) indicated their dissatisfaction with district government (with respect to employment and benefits received by Islanders), as well as the concern over the erosion caused by seawaves, and frustration at the few benefits received from the site. At one point last year local island residents threatened to stop all tourism to the island if they saw no benefits.

The Ruins Committee made a plea for work to be done to address the erosion of the island, and for a boat to be provided to transport visitors to other sites on the island.

Figure 4: Representatives of the Ruins Committee on Kilwa Kisiwani



Source: Author's picture, January 2009

NGOs

A new NGO has been set up by islanders and recently registered as the ***Kilwa Cultural Centre***. This centre hopes to improve the lot of residents. Its objectives include raising awareness of local people regarding the site and its protection, and facilitating opportunities for economic development on the island. To date this NGO has started working with the community to increase understanding of the conservation imperatives associated with the ruins and to generally raise the awareness of the significance of the site.

Kilwa Cultural Centre has also identified sites where turtles lay eggs and are keen to include this as a tourist attraction. At the time of the study tour, the chairman of this

NGO was in Kenya to better understand the tourism development models and approaches utilised in that country.

Within the broader Kilwa District, a number of ngo's exist with community development objectives. Some are local NGOs, others are international.

- Christian Refugees Organisation

According to an official of the Ministry of Tourism, this NGO is active in the Kilwa area, and have expressed an interest in getting involved in community development in support of Kilwa Kisiwani.

- World Wildlife Fund (WWF)

WWF is active in Kilwa. Although their geographic focus stops short of the island, it does extend to Kilwa Masoko. Their main activities relate to marine conservation in the area. In particular, they are active in working with local fishermen to try and encourage more sustainable fishing methods, as well as alternative livelihoods' strategies. WWF has provided some handicraft training in the area.

- Mpingo Conservation project

Mpingo Conservation works on community forestry. They are interested in supporting local ownership and control of the timber value chain and increasing income from the local blackwood (Mpingo), which is high quality/ high value timber. They are working in four pilot sites and are hoping to receive Forest Stewardship Council certification for the timber produced by these sites shortly.

- Changamoto

Registered in September 2007, this community group of fifty-seven members was initially established for traditional dancing. However the tourist interest has not been sufficient to sustain this activity and the group has started making batik and handicraft items. They have received some support from the lodges, most notably Kilwa Dreams. They expressed a desire for premises from which to work.

Figure 3: Changamoto's batik clothing



Source: Author's photograph, January 2009.

- Mkuje Group

Mkuje group started as a fishing group in 2002. The fishers used to employ nets to catch fish but are moving away from this to pursue other economic activities, particular tourism. They were assisted and provided with modern fishing gear and a boat. They have applied to the Ministry of Tourism to get permission to formalise the tourism transportation and guiding in the area. The idea is to have a controlled guiding system which will limit who can guide, and will set prices.

- Upendo Women Group

Upendo Women Group was established in February 2006 and has thirty members. Their objective is to work together to create employment and financial empowerment for their members. They cook different foods, and received training at Folklore college with money provided by the Ministry of Tourism. They do not have premises to cook from or at which to serve food. There is an agreement with Kilwa Dreams lodge, where they cater from time to time.

Folklore Development College

This government funded college has provided training to a number of the community groups in the area, including tour guide training and catering training.

Tour Guides

Six tour guides have been trained at the Folklore College in tour guiding techniques. Three of these guides are currently undergoing further training in Arusha. This training was made possible through financial contributions from Sweden. The tour guides include residents of the island itself, as well as Songa Mnara and the Kilwa Masoko (the mainland town). There is no formal tour guides association as yet.

Private Sector Lodges

There are no tourism establishments or restaurants on the island of Kilwa Kisiwani. Six mid- to upmarket private sector lodges were identified in Kilwa Masoko during meetings with District officials. These are:

- Kilwa Dreams
- Kilwa Seaview
- Kilwa Ruins
- Kimbilio Lodge
- Jimbizo Beach Resort
- Kilwa Safari (not open).

Figure 4: Bungalow at Kimbilio Lodge, Kilwa Masoko



Source: Author's photograph, January 2009

Two of the aforementioned lodges were without manager during the site visit. One of the lodges has had a number of owners in recent years, and appeared to be partially closed during the site visit. Without significant visitor numbers, the lodges appear to be financially marginal.

There are also a number of locally owned and run guesthouses in the area. According to Mesaki (2005):

“These include two medium standard ones, Mjaka Family Village and Hilton Guest House, as well as ordinary, namely Kagera, Lumumba, Mjaka Enterprises No. 1, Mjaka Guest House No. 1&2, Waridi Guest House, Mikumi , Pande, New Tulivu, Butiama, Legal, New Wakati, and New Chacha guest houses. Local Kilwa people own all of them. Kilwa Kivinje has only seven guesthouses: Gofuni, Kivinje, King Warda, Mziwanda, Savoye, New Sudi's and Four Ways. There are also two guest houses at Njia Nne, two at Songo Songo island, two at Nangurukuru, three at Mandawa, while the other prominent highway stations of Somanga, Njinjo and Nanjirinji have one guest house each”.

2.3.2 Institutional Structures

There are no formal structures for engagement between the parties at present although a joint management committee has been recommended in the management plan for the WHS. Discussions indicated that a variety of engagements

have been held between various national and local stakeholders demonstrating interest in developing the site.

Discussions with the Ruins Committee on the island indicated that a breakdown in communication, and some confusion around commitments made from various parties visiting the island, exists.

There are a number of opportunities to coordinate stakeholder relationships more effectively, both at a sectoral level (tour guides; lodges; government) and at an overarching level. This is discussed further under Recommendations.

2.3.3 Plans and Information

Much research, strategy and planning work has been undertaken by the various stakeholders involved and interested in Kilwa Kisiwani over the past few years. These documents include, but are not limited to:

- Kamamba, D. M. K. 2000 (draft). Kilwa Kisiwani and Songo Mnara Conservation and Development Plan. Dar es Salaam, Tanzania.
- Ngoile, Dr. M. 2001. Kilwa: Paradise Lost. Dar es Salaam, Tanzania.
- Ngoile, Dr. M. 2001. Destination: Kilwa. Dar es Salaam, Tanzania
- Scheseresse, Jean and Nzuki 2001 (draft). Towards a Tourism Master Plan for Kilwa. Tourism Division, Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism, Dar es Salaam.
- SEACAM 2000. Guidelines for the Environmental Assessment of Coastal Tourism. SEACAM, Maputo Mozambique.
- Tanzania Coastal Management Partnership 1999. Socioeconomic Assessment of Tanzania's Coastal Regions. TCMP Working Document: 5006 TCMP.
- Tanzania Coastal Management Partnership 1999. Tanzania Mariculture Issue Profile. TCMP. Working Document: 5009 TCMP.
- Tanzanian Coastal Management Partnership 2001. Tanzanian Coastal Tourism Situational Analysis 2001. National Environmental Management Council, the University of Rhode Island/Coastal Resources Center and the United States Agency for International Development
- Mesaki, Dr S. 2005. A Portrait of Kilwa. A glorious Past, abundant Potential and a Prosperous future.
- Kilwa Tourism Masterplan, 2005

- Management Plan, Kilwa Kisiwani.
- A recently completed report on Kilwa Kisiwani by UNESCO (this was not made available for the purposes of this situational analysis)
- An SNV report on Kilwa (not available)

Access to these documents remains problematic with no central source of information, nor of updated plans.

2.4 THE FINANCING MODELS AND REVENUE STREAMS

2.4.1 Capital Investment in Kilwa Kisiwani

Since 2002, UNESCO and the French government, in partnership with the Ministry of Antiquities have invested in rehabilitating the site. This includes clearing vegetation, supporting building structures and architectural work, and the development of interpretative signs.

A new project, to address the erosion caused by seawave action, is about to kickoff in early 2009 and is to be funded by UNESCO. Further work on interpretation and the preservation of the site is ongoing in Songo Mnara, funded by the French Embassy and UNESCO.

Solar panels and a borehole were installed on the island by the Ministry of Antiquities. The solar panels were stolen in late 2008, with no source of energy on the island existing at present.

2.4.2 Operational Expenditure

Day-to-day operational expenditure is financed by the Ministry of Antiquities' through its budget from the national fiscus. This operational expenditure appears to be largely limited to staff salaries and district council office overheads.

The World Bank paid for the development of interpretative material in the form of an information booklet on the history of the site and the ruins. This has since been turned into site brochures (inclusive of a map and information on the various ruins).

2.4.3 Income from Kilwa Kisiwani

Foreign tourists are charged 1500 Tanzanian Shillings each - equivalent to just over 1 US \$ per person – to visit the island. Nationals are charged 500 Tanzanian Shillings each. Given that there are only about 1000 visitors to the island each year, assuming most are foreign, this amounts to less than 2 000 000 Tanzanian Shillings per annum. No other income is received from the island as no add-on services, or merchandising, exists.

2.5 THE EXISTING AND POTENTIAL VISITOR MARKETS

As already indicated, visitor numbers are very low. Prior to the completion of the bridge, there was even less tourism in the area: none of the lodges are more than five years old.

It appears that current visitation to the area is motivated by fishing, diving and specialized visits to Kilwa by governments, agencies, and specialists.

Part of the challenge of increasing tourist arrivals to the area, as identified by stakeholders, is the dominance in the marketplace of the iconic Tanzanian sites of Zanzibar, Serengeti, Kiliminjaro, Ngorongoro and the underdevelopment of other sites. The Southern Circuit – a tourist route/ destination development plan for Southern Tanzania – has not as yet taken off. The Kilwa Tourism Masterplan (2005) makes reference to this Southern Circuit, and Kilwa's place as a 'link-point' within it.

Accessibility is a limiting factor in this regard with respect to both road and air access. Marketing of the Southern attractions to both consumers, and partnership with the trade (tour operators) is critical to improve the awareness of and support for tourism areas in the South.

2.5.1 Tourism Facilities

In tourism, demand is also generated by supply. Other than Kilwa Kisiwani, there exists few other developed tourist attractions in the area and the private sector players are few, and relatively small. This means there is little marketing of Kilwa at all- as marketing is a function of private sector product owners, together with the tourism marketing agencies of the state.

This is not to say there are not many potential tourist attractions- there are. But few have been developed as yet.

2.6 SOCIO-ECONOMIC AND COMMUNITY IMPACTS

2.6.1 Residents of the Island

Residents of the island receive few (and, equally, are able to generate few) direct benefits from the site. They have received a water source and energy source to date, but the solar panels have since been stolen. A health clinic has been set up, but without power its operations are hampered. A jetty has recently been constructed but was not in use during the site visit.

2.6.2 The Tour Guides

To date six tour guides have been trained. Discussions with one of the lodges indicated that they are happy to support local tour guides, and are satisfied with the level of the interpretative experience that is delivered (it is not certain if this is true of all the tour guides or just those that the lodge works with). These tour guide fees are not part of the visitor fee charged by the Ministry. Rather, this is determined by the tour guides themselves, or in discussion with the lodge owners, who will package a trip to the site (with tour guide services) for their guests.

2.6.3 Community Groups

The community groups on Kilwa Masoko indicated that there are ad hoc opportunities to benefit from tourism at present. These opportunities seem to have been facilitated by the lodges, particularly Kilwa Dreams, which solicits help from the Upendo group for catering when they have groups of guests. They have also asked Chagamoto to perform traditional dances for guests. However it was clear that these opportunities to derive income from tourism are not regular, nor are they substantial.

2.7 CAPACITY CONSTRAINTS

The Ministry of Antiquities indicated that they have skills' shortages in the area of cultural heritage and conservation management, with most of their staff being archeologists. This is a general problem for the organization in relation to all the sites under management. Work on documenting and researching the site has been undertaken by the Ministry together with partners such as the French government, UNESCO and the World Bank.

2.8 THE NATURAL ENVIRONMENT, AND MANAGEMENT THEREOF

The seawave action is the biggest natural threat to the island at present. There is also work to be done on uncovering foliage from more ruin sites. Grazing by goats is a challenge too.

Mangroves have been replanted on some parts of the island although it will take some years before these are fully grown.

The broader Kilwa area is rich in natural resources, from the diversity of marine (including turtles, dugon and coelacanths) to Mpingo blackwood. Although WWF indicated that the island of Kilwa Kisiwani was not within the geographical scope of their focus, some discussions have taken place with local fishermen regarding fishing practices.

2.9 THE LINKAGE BETWEEN THE CULTURAL TOURISM ATTRACTIONS AND BROADER DESTINATION DEVELOPMENT

As already indicated, a number of tourism reports, masterplans and strategies exist for tourism in Tanzania. All recognize the potential of Southern Tanzania and Kilwa in particular. The Kilwa Tourism Masterplan (2005) identifies the cultural heritage complex as a strategic tourism asset and makes a number of suggestions on work to be done in the area.

It appears that Kilwa's current (limited) tourist markets travel to the area for the diving, fishing and the WHS. Interviews with a lodge manager indicated that their guests' primary purpose of visit was in fact to dive, not to see the site. Another lodge caters largely for fishing tourists. Undoubtedly the beauty and offerings of the broader Kilwa area provide a number of reasons to visit the destination. This variety of offerings can help create a diverse tourist market in the future. At present, however, Kilwa could at best be described as an emerging destination. Visitor

numbers and the tourism product are not yet sufficiently developed for the area to be a major drawcard in the country.

3. RECOMMENDATIONS

The most significant challenges facing Kilwa Kisiwani, as clearly articulated by the Acting Permanent Secretary in the Ministry, Mr. Kamamba, are:

- Seawave erosion
- Vegetation growth on the ruins
- Inadequate participation and understanding of the local people (those living amongst the Ruins of Kilwa Kisiwani) on the conservation of the WHS.
- Poverty of the local inhabitants – lack of finance, education, health services and so on - impacting upon their ability to create meaningful mechanisms to benefit from tourism to the island.

A number of steps need to be taken to address these threats to the site, to ensure that local economic development (LED) takes place, and that tourism develops in an inclusive and responsible manner.

3.1 COORDINATION AND COMMUNICATION

Many stakeholders wish to contribute positively to the development of Kilwa Kisiwani. These stakeholders exist both in and around the WHS (i.e. at a local level) and at the national level, with embassies, donor bodies, and the like playing an active role.

Interviewees have indicated the need for a coordinated approach, with clear roles and responsibilities. This will move away from the current fragmented approach. In this regard, efforts are underway to coordinate stakeholders into a task team of sorts. This is currently being spearheaded by the Department's Tourism Ministry. It is critical that there remains a convener or champion of this initiative, to drive this formation until such times as structures and plans are in place, and a coordinating mechanism is well-entrenched.

A number of institutional structures should be considered. The actual form that these structures take will depend on both the development of the area, and timing.

It may be unrealistic and unreasonable to expect all the structures described below to be formed in the short-term. The list below should thus be considered as only indicative of the options that exist for stakeholder coordination:

- An overarching steering committee at national level which includes key national and international bodies.
- A Joint Management Committee. This committee should include a limited number of key stakeholders of the actual WHS at the local level. The establishment and operation of such a committee is already proposed in the Management Plan for the site, and is a standard institutional structure at WHS's, allowing for coordination and communication amongst immediate stakeholders around site management issues. Meetings should be regular with standing items on the agenda to allow for inputs from the various stakeholder groups. These groups should at a minimum include:
 - The Ministry of Antiquities, particular the site manager (as chairperson)
 - Representatives of the Island community, through the Ruins Committee; or an alternative, elected representative body
 - The District Commission
 - A representative of the tour guides association (see below for more recommendations on this body)
 - A representative of the local tourism association (see below for more recommendations on this body)
- A Tour Guides' Association. A proposal in this regard is that the trained tour guides should organise themselves into a membership body/association to represent their interests. This can be a relatively informal structure which allows for coordination of the tour guides around specific issues relating to their situation as and when these arise. Possible roles for this association could involve: putting in place of standards (around pricing, quality, visitor feedback, etc), and a code of practice; lobbying government and the lodges (advocacy); and marketing of services to tourism products and businesses alike. Tourist guide associations exist elsewhere in the country – such as for Kiliminjaro – and could provide some direction on how to structure and organize such a body.
- A tourism association. In time the lodges and other tourist operators in the area should be encouraged to form an organization that represents local private sector interests.
- A local tourism organization. In more developed destinations it is common to have a public-private partnership form of tourism association which is funded by both public and privates sources. These Local Tourism Organisations (LTOs) provide a critical offering with respect to joint tourism

strategy and implementation to the benefit of the destination. In Cape Town, for example, Cape Town Tourism, the LTO, undertakes marketing, visitor services, business support, lobbying and the like.

Given the lack of tourism officials at the local level, some consideration needs to be given to the development of such capacity –either within the Ministry of Antiquities staff complement, or through deployment of an official from the Ministry of Tourism.

3.2 PLANNING, INFORMATION MANAGEMENT, MONITORING AND EVALUATION

Directly related to the necessary coordination of stakeholder co-ordination, and communication between these stakeholders, is the development of a broad overarching plan ('masterplan' or 'destination plan') for Kilwa Kisiwani, including elements of tourism development for Kilwa Masoko and surrounds too. A joint plan will allow for proper, aligned implementation of conservation, development and tourism activities. It will clearly demarcate who, when, what, how much, etc.

A number of studies and plans have been conducted on Kilwa in the past five years. With the anticipated formation of a broad task team, these existing documents and strategies need to be consolidated into the overall plan. The roles and responsibilities of the various stakeholders need to be clearly defined in relation to this overarching plan.

The new shared Kilwa Kisiwani destination plan should be used as a management document to guide activities, monitor progress against objectives, and ensure aligned implementation. Such a document is likely to give consideration to the various roles and activities that can be played with respect to the site. Possible areas that could be covered within such a plan are listed below. This is an indicative list only:

- Conservation and rehabilitation of the ruins (this is also likely to be the core focus of the official Management plan for the site as developed by the Ministry of Antiquities)
- Interpretative materials and signage
- Transportation and access related issues, both on the island, and to the island
- Stakeholder coordination and structures including partnerships
- Tour guiding services and offerings

- Visitor facilities, including a visitor centre, toilets, merchandising and the like
- Research and information including both scientific and academic research, and visitor research to allow for improved offerings and a better understanding of visitor markets and trends
- Marketing of the WHS
- Economic development opportunities for the local inhabitants and broader Kilwa community
- Income enhancing strategies
- Basic infrastructure (water, energy, waste, sanitation services)
- Nature conservation and environmental strategies (with respect to fishing, the mangroves, erosion, visitor impacts, etc.)
- Future development plans (to include the rehabilitation of other ruins, tourism services on the island, etc.)
- Education and skills; awareness raising amongst local people.

The Kilwa Tourism Masterplan, developed in 2005, is a detailed document that provides many useful recommendations on the development of the area to the benefit of local people. Certain of those recommendations are re-iterated in this situational analysis although the level of research and detail of the masterplan is far more substantial.

3.3 DEVELOPING A VISITOR-CENTRIC APPROACH

Tourism can undoubtedly bring more benefits to the area than are currently being realised. Even with existing visitor numbers, a number of site enhancements could lead to greater value being extracted, and increased benefits for the various stakeholder groups being shared.

In order to galvanise and capture the socio-economic development power of tourism, more needs to be done to make the WHS and the general tourism environment visitor-centric. In other words, planning (as proposed above) should consider how to improve the visitor experience of the site, and the broader Kilwa area. This can also be linked to an effective strategy to increase and capture more income from visitors to the area and to distribute this widely.

Certain lessons can be drawn from cultural World Heritage Sites elsewhere in the region. Both Twyfelfontein (in Namibia) and Robben Island (in South Africa)

provide organised visitor experiences, which notwithstanding certain challenges of their own, incorporate elements that may be instructive for Kilwa Kisiwani:

- There are visitor embarkation points at both sites: in Cape Town, within the V&A Waterfront, there exists a sophisticated visitor centre (Nelson Mandela Gateway). This gateway includes a 150 person auditorium, as well as historical exhibits. Tickets are sold here at R180 for adults and R90 for all children under the age of 18. The three and a half hour tour includes a return trip across Table Bay, a visit to the Maximum Security Prison, interaction with an ex-political prisoner and a 45 minute bus tour with a guide providing commentary.
- Twyfelfontein's visitor experience is a far more modest affair - more appropriate to the setting of that site. A small, totally renewable building greets visitors when they arrive. This award-winning building is made from local materials and corrugated iron and blends into the backdrop of red rock.

Figure 5: Visitor Centre at Twyfelfontein



Source: Author's picture, December 2008.

Each visitor to Twyfelfontein pays a global entrance fee (like with Robben Island) of 30 Namibian Dollars which includes the services of a tour guide (whether these are utilised or not).

In the Twyfelfontein visitor centre, visitors have an opportunity to read a number of interpretative boards hanging in two rooms adjacent to the reception facility. These provide some introductory notes on the history of the site, the rock art painting, and its symbolism.

Three different walking trails to view the rock art are offered – a short self-guided tour, a 45 minute tour (accompanied by a tour guide) or a 30 minute tour (also accompanied by a tour guide). The paths are clearly demarcated with specific viewing points for rock art sites. This manages the site impacts of the visitor numbers.

Upon returning to the visitor centre, there is an opportunity to purchase a cold drink from a kiosk. There is also a craft shop in the facility, which sells local craft items (necklaces, curios, and the like).

The examples of Robben Island and Twyfelfontein demonstrate ways in which a visitor experience can be orchestrated. Certain benefits of the dedicated facilities and organised visitor experiences include:

- a professional, largely standardized and informative visitor experience,
- limitation of environmental impacts on site through managed transportation services and marked out walking/ coach routes, and
- direct benefits to certain stakeholders groups whose offering is included in the package (tour guides in both cases are remunerated based on the cost of the global ticket price).

3.4 CREATING LOCAL BENEFITS

Tourism is in its infancy in Kilwa. Both the state of transport access (the road and the lack of competition in flights), as well as the competition from more established, better branded and better known sites in Tanzania (Zanibar, Serengeti, Mount Kiliminjaro, Ngorongoro Crater, etc.), have retarded Kilwa's tourism development.

It is likely that the road will be complete within the next 12 to 24 months (to early 2011) and this (relative) hiatus presents a great opportunity for stakeholders to plan and coordinate activities in the interim. This should include the development of visitor experiences which create meaningful community benefits.

Direct benefits from tourism are currently limited to the ad hoc use of tour guides, occasional income from local crafts and traditional food preparation, and the impact of the lodges on local employment.

As the visitor tariff is low, and visitor numbers are few, the income from tourism to Kilwa Kisiwani is currently negligible. This encourages neither the recognition of its commercial value, nor investment in the site. It also limits the ability of the Ministry of Antiquities to share the income from visitor fees.

With a change in Antiquities' policy already in place and a revision to the law forthcoming, both visitor fees and the apportionment thereof (to accommodate island residents) are under consideration. Although visitor numbers are likely to remain very low until such time as access to the site is improved (i.e. the road completed, and competition introduced with respect to air transportation), in the medium to long term (5 to 10 years), it is likely that visitor numbers could increase quite considerably. The visitor fee amount, apportionment thereof and ring-fencing of a portion of the income from Kiwa Kisiwani to be re-invested in the site and area should thus be investigated now, in preparation for the future.

Socio-economic benefits are unlikely to expand rapidly until such time as visitor numbers increase significantly and/ or more private sector investment is experienced in the broader Kilwa area. There are nevertheless a few areas in which community participation and benefit flows may be increased based on the current situation:

- Merchandising and other community/ pro-poor business development opportunities exist within the tourism supply chain at Kilwa Kisiwani, but also in the Kilwa destination area. Many have already been identified by stakeholders; some have been acted upon but require more work:
 - Catering/ food and beverage services to include traditional meals, as well as on site provision of chilled drinks and snacks on the island.
 - Handicraft/ curios as well as other merchandising. The site brochure (which appears to be out of stock) could be sold to visitors for a moderate fee (US 1.5 / 2) each to supplement income. In addition, the more detailed booklet could also be printed to sale to visitors. Additional merchandising related to the site could include postcards, t-shirts, calendars, and locally relevant craft/ cultural products. It may be that the investment in merchandising beyond existing materials (the brochure and booklet) is planned for when visitor numbers have reached a certain level to sustain the production of these goods at some (small) scale.
 - Transportation services. Some thought should be given to transportation to the island, transportation around the island and transportation to Songa Mnara and Kilwa Kivinge. At present the lodges coordinate and charge for much of the transport to the island. Local dhows provide an alternative experience which many visitors may choose because of the authenticity and 'romantic historical' appeal of these boats.
 - In and around the island itself, the Kilwa Cultural Centre has already identified the need to better clear paths between the ruins so that

they can provide a transportation service (at a fee) to visitors. This is a good idea as the weather is very hot most of the year, and visitors are may be keen to be transported. It will also enable ruins further afield to be visited.

- One of the lodges indicated that it is difficult to source agricultural products that are grown locally. An opportunity exists for community groups to grow and sell vegetables to the lodges. Other items, such as craft, etc. can also be sold to the lodges for on-selling to their guests. Alternatively, or in addition to this, the proposed visitor centre in Kilwa Masoko could provide space for local craft work to be displayed.

Taking advantage of these business development opportunities for local inhabitants and community groups requires the services of an intermediary business development agency that has the expertise, experience and resources to create business linkages. A dedicated and permanent business support service is recommended in this regard.

Christian Refugees Organisation has already indicated its interest in getting involved in community development on the island. The Aga Khan NGO is already active in these areas in Zanzibar and could also be approached should Christian Refugees Organisation not be able to assist.

A dedicated and appropriate institution is needed to facilitate these business linkages. One of the reasons that local inhabitants of the island have not yet benefited from tourism is that there are limited resources for local economic development, community development and tourism within local government.

3.5 TOURISM CAPACITY CONSTRAINTS

Other than a lack of dedicated business linkage services, particularly for tourism value chains, there is also a more general lack of tourism skills in Kilwa Kisiwani. Neither the District Council, nor the Ministry of Antiquities has tourism experts and perhaps it is not their place to do so. The Ministry of Tourism does not have a local presence at the moment although it has assisted with a number of training interventions. The private sector is relatively weak with few, marginal businesses in existence.

It is essential that tourism skills are now used to direct the development of an appropriate visitor centre and experience, incorporate local business development into tourism supply chains, and to create a visitor offering that excels.

A visitor centre is planned for Kilwa Masoko. This centre could best facilitate the promotion and coordination of tourism in Kilwa in general, and could perhaps be supported by a smaller, more targeted arrival facility on Kilwa Kisiwani, which would relate to the ruins' experience in particular.

In the medium to long term, as tourism grows to the area, a tourism information officer could be employed -possibly grant funded, or co-funded by local parties – to manage information on tourism offerings, refer guests, run visitor satisfaction surveys, create a space for local craft to be sold on premises, and facilitate regular meetings amongst all tourism stakeholders. As already indicated earlier in this report, there exist a number of models on local tourism organizations and visitor information centres already in place elsewhere.

3.6 DESTINATION EFFECT

Ultimately the success of tourism (as defined by its contribution to the conservation and development of the site, and the creation of benefits for local people) in Kilwa Kisiwani will reside not just on the strategies employed there, but on the development of the broader tourism destination.

Kilwa District has many potential attractions. These range from marine species such as whale sharks, to coelacanths, and turtles; to other heritage and natural sites, and terrestrial wildlife. The development of a 'Southern Circuit' to possibly incorporate Selous and the Mtwara Bay area has been spoken about for some time. With the development of Kilwa Kisiwani, and improvements in transport infrastructure, it is possible that this Southern Circuit will become a viable alternative and competitor to the very established and well-branded attractions around Arusha, and Zanzibar. This development and marketing of the Southern Circuit will necessarily require coordination between private sector operators and tourism authorities, as well as the co-operation of transport services providers (such as charter airlines).

4. CONCLUSION

Kilwa Kisiwani is a 'new kid' on the tourism block. Prior to 2003, transport infrastructure and the lack of rehabilitation of the ruins meant the WHS site received few visitors. This is slowly starting to change. The realisation that Kilwa Kisiwani is a remarkable cultural treasure and as such has much potential to be a force for development and tourism, is gaining momentum.

It is likely that with the completion of the last 60kms of the road linking Dar es Salaam and Kilwa in the next year or two, visitor numbers will increase. This increase might be from 1500 to 2500, 3000. While not significant visitor numbers, a steady increase in visitor flows presents stakeholders with a window of opportunity. Critical to realizing the socio-economic benefits that tourism can bring, is to put in place structures, plans and relationships to support the responsible development of Kilwa Kisiwani (including the conservation of the sites, and local benefits) as well as Kilwa Masoko. This needs to be deliberate and orchestrated. A number of recommendations have already been made in this regard.

Indeed, discussions indicated that there is much interest in this effort across a range of stakeholder groups. Work is currently being led by the Ministry of Tourism to establish a task team and formulate a broad strategy, to inform action. Alignment of stakeholders is being spoken of.

Tourism can be a double-edged sword and planning can help minimize the potential negative impacts associated with the sector. Negative impacts can include:

- The creation of poorly paid and seasonal jobs.
- The use of land for development purposes (e.g. building of lodges) may limit local communities access to resources (such as the sea), hence the need for a strategic land use plan which is both implemented and monitored.
- Cultural change may occur with migration inwards as a result of economic growth and employment opportunities.
- Many of the benefits may be captured by certain players in the value chain – by the more established private sector in other words- with little of the tourist expenditure reaching local people.

- Environmental impacts may be severe due to pressure on resources (such as water), waste from tourism facilities and the like, and an increasingly demand for seafood from guests.
- Increased pressure may be placed on other infrastructure, such as energy, and transport, from increasing visitor numbers.

There exists a wealth of information on how to implement responsible tourism – tourism that is responsible to people, environment and the economy. An explicit approach of local supplier development (e.g. of craft, transport services, food and beverages, guiding, marine based tour operating, etc.) must be followed. Building a tight network of relations between stakeholders now will create strong foundations and skilled local suppliers for when tourism starts to boom in years to come. Kilwa has the opportunity to plan for responsible tourism – an opportunity that many destinations do not have. This opportunity should be seized.

5. REFERENCES

1. SEACAM 2000. Guidelines for the Environmental Assessment of Coastal Tourism. SEACAM, Maputo Mozambique.
2. Tanzanian Coastal Management Partnership 2001. Tanzanian Coastal Tourism Situational Analysis 2001. National Environmental Management Council, the University of Rhode Island/Coastal Resources Center and the United States Agency for International Development
3. Mesaki, Dr S. 2005. A Portrait of Kilwa. A glorious Past, abundant Potential and a Prosperous future.
4. Kilwa Tourism Masterplan, 2005
5. Moon, K. 2005. Kilwa Kisiwani publication. World Bank.